# Goldman Sachs

**Equity Research** 

# The rise of Russian pension funds

# Russian pension funds: \$200 bn industry by 2020

## Pension fund assets can triple by 2020

Having cleaned up the pension system in 2013-14, the Russian government now seems ready to allow resumption of contributions to private pension funds. The impact will be large: we forecast Russian pension fund assets will increase to c.US\$200 bn by 2020 from \$64 bn today. The creation of this sticky, long-term domestic investor base is likely to produce significant benefits for Russian capital markets, particularly for stocks.

## Allocation to equities will likely increase

Russian pension funds today allocate over 80% of their assets to fixed income, including bank deposits. Globally, however, as pension funds mature and their assets grow, the share of equities tends to go up. In Russia additional tailwinds should come from lower interest rates and regulation. We estimate Russian funds can hold up to \$60 bn of local equities by 2020 (55% of total estimated free float), compared with \$6 bn now and \$32 bn owned by foreign investors.

## Russian capital markets can change

Russian capital markets can be profoundly changed by the rise of pension funds. In fixed income, pension funds will likely create demand for long-term, secure, inflation-linked products. Russian real interest rates– which are now at a substantial premium to the EM median – should decline. In equity markets, pension funds' investments can decrease volatility and improve valuations, as well as increase dividend payout ratios.

## Key beneficiaries: MOEX, MGNT, ALRS

All Russian financial markets should benefit from the rise of Russian pension funds. Within our coverage, we see Moscow Exchange as an important beneficiary, as it provides the primary trading infrastructure. We like Magnit's local shares, which should narrow their discount to GDRs as local pension funds invest onshore. Finally, we highlight Alrosa, where solid FCF gives it room to respond to greater appetite for dividend yield.

### Dmitry Trembovolsky

+7(495)645-4241 dmitry.trembovolsky@gs.com OOO Goldman Sachs Bank

### Anton Farlenkov

+7(495)645-4019 anton.farlenkov@gs.com OOO Goldman Sachs Bank

### Igor Gerasimov

+7(495)645-4012 igor.gerasimov@gs.com OOO Goldman Sachs Bank

### **Daniil Fedorov**

+7(495)645-4038 danill.fedorov@gs.com OOO Goldman Sachs Bank

### Yulia Chekunaeva

+44(20)7552-9935 yulia.chekunaeva@gs.com Goldman Sachs International

Goldman Sachs does and seeks to do business with companies covered in its research reports. As a result, investors should be aware that the firm may have a conflict of interest that could affect the objectivity of this report. Investors should consider this report as only a single factor in making their investment decision. For Reg AC certification and other important disclosures, see the Disclosure Appendix, or go to www.gs.com/research/hedge.html. Analysts employed by non-US affiliates are not registered/qualified as research analysts with FINRA in the U.S.

# Table of contents

PM summary	3
Russian pension fund AuM may reach c.\$200 bn	5
Asset mix will likely shift towards equities	7
1) Increase in scale to increase complexity	7
2) Change in regulation to allow higher risk	9
3) Decline in interest rates	9
Pension funds can change Russian equity and debt markets	10
MOEX (Buy): Main beneficiary of capital market development	16
Magnit (Buy): Changes in Russian capital markets to support strong fundamental story	17
Alrosa (Buy): Dividends/deleveraging to come as solid FCF generation sustained	18
Key risks	19
Appendix 1: Market structure	20
Appendix 2: Russian pension system structure and key developments	21
Appendix 3: Regulatory constraints on NPF investments	23
Appendix 4: Design of the Polish and SA pension systems	24
Disclosure Appendix	25

Prices in this note are as of the close on August 26, 2015, unless otherwise noted.

# PM summary

Russian capital markets have always needed a consistent long-term, sticky domestic investor base. This need for funding was exacerbated over the last couple of years, as external financial markets became largely closed. This environment recently led the Russian government to state its intention to allow resumption of contributions to the private pension system, which started in 2004, but were frozen in 2013. With this report we assess:

- The potential size of the Russian private pension fund system,
- Asset allocation strategies of pension funds, and,
- Implications for equity- and fixed-income markets.

## Change in regulation to revive growth in Russian pension system

The Russian pension industry was born in 2002, when the government required 6% of every employee's salary to be contributed to state or private pension funds. Since then, total pension fund assets under management (AuM) reached \$64 bn, and according to official statistics the private pension funds client base reached 28 mn people vs. 52 mn in state pension funds, while the asset split is \$33 bn in private funds and \$31 bn in state.

The Russian government froze transfers to private pension funds in 2013-14 to strengthen the system. The key concern was that without better regulation pension funds could make investments that are too risky (e.g. real estate, related party projects), and that the government would ultimately be accountable if some of these pension funds were to go bankrupt.

The overhaul included: 1) a change in the legal status of pension funds to for-profit, 2) set-up of a special fund to guarantee savings in the case of bankruptcy, and 3) merging the previous regulator (Federal Service for Financial Markets) with the Central Bank of Russia, and shifting oversight to the central bank. In the spring of 2015, Russian government officials supported the resumption of contributions to private pension funds (Vedomosti April 24, 2015), citing the need to create a long-term domestic capital pool; first funds were disbursed in May. As a result of the changes, we forecast Russian pension fund assets to increase c.\$120 bn by 2020 to nearly US\$200 bn, on a combination of inflows and investment returns.

## Equity allocations could increase to US\$60 bn by 2020

Russian pension funds currently allocate over 80% of their assets into fixed income, including bank deposits. We believe this will change in the mid-term for the following reasons:

- First, such high allocation is typical for nascent pension systems. In South Africa the allocation to fixed income was 60%-70% in the 1980s, but fell to just 38% in 2014. We find that globally as pension funds' assets grow, the share of non-fixed income assets tends to increase as funds diversify into equities.
- Second, we believe that changes in the remuneration scheme for private pension funds (e.g. lengthening of the requirements for profitability to 5-year horizon from 1 year) will incentivize pension funds to take more risk.
- Finally, lower interest rates, as expected by our economists, will likely push pension funds to invest more in equity.

We believe an increase in asset allocation towards equities would further increase the importance of pension funds in domestic markets: we calculate that their current equity AuM of \$6 bn can increase to \$40-60 bn by 2020 (35%-55% of the estimated total free float), compared with just \$32 bn owned by foreign investors at the moment.

# Higher valuation, lower volatility for equities and lower rates for fixed income are key implications

We believe that both fixed income and equity markets will benefit from potential changes in the Russian pension system (see Exhibit 1).

As a result of these changes, we highlight Moscow Exchange, which stands to benefit from growth in volumes, Magnit, which currently has the highest discount of its local shares to GDRs, and Alrosa, which has high dividend payout potential that will likely attract pension investors.

### **Exhibit 1: Development of the Russian pension system will significantly affect Russian capital markets** Potential implications to financial markets from changes to the pension system

Potential implications to financial markets from expected changes to the pension system						
	Lower market volatility	Enhanced dividend discipline	Higher valuations			
Equities	Pension funds create sticky local investor base with lower turnover of holdings, which should decrease volatility and support stock multiples	Pension funds' investments are generally value-oriented and encourage sound dividend policies	Additional flows would positively affect stock valuation, market volumes and IPO activity			
	Lower real rates	Demand for new products				
Fixed income	Pension funds will drive the demand for debt, lowering level of real rates	As pension funds' asset base grows they will be looking for new products higher yields				

Source: Goldman Sachs Global Investment Research.

# Russian pension fund AuM may reach c.\$200 bn

The modern Russian pension system, formed more than a decade ago, has grown into a substantial provider of capital for local fixed income and equity markets. With 80 mn participants (65% in state funds and 35% in private funds as of 2014) it has amassed over \$60 bn of assets, and keeps growing. Indeed, we estimate the pool of capital represented by Russian pension funds can increase to c.\$200 bn in the next five years, driven by both inflows and investment returns.

Inflows into the Russian pension system are funded by employers, which by law contribute 6% of employee salaries to the Pension Fund of Russia (PFR), while voluntary contributions are funded either by employers or employees on their own initiative. Mandatory contributions are then either left with PFR to manage or are transferred to private pension funds, depending on the choice of the employee, while voluntary contributions always go to private funds. We illustrate the design of the pension system in more detail in Appendix 2 (Exhibits 30-31).

In our forecasts of inflows we assume pension funds will continue getting 6% of the gross salary pool. We also assume that private pension funds will continue to increase their market share by c.0.5 mn people a year (in 2014 2.4 mn were added). We forecast CPI+150 bp per year return for private pension funds, in line with their stated targets and recent history. For the state pension fund, we assume a more conservative CPI+50 bp.

### Exhibit 2: Pension fund assets under management (AuM) expected to grow at a 20% CAGR in the next 5 years Russian pension fund AuM forecasts



Scenario under the assumption that inflow of mandatory pension savings into private system will continue

Source: CBR, Pension Fund of Russia, Goldman Sachs Global Investment Research.





Source: CBR, Pension Fund of Russia, Goldman Sachs Global Investment Research.

# In equity markets Russian pension funds can become 2x bigger than foreign funds

We forecast Russian pension funds to grow at a CAGR of c.20% in the next 5 years, however, penetration of their assets would continue to remain low relative to more developed markets – around c.11% of GDP by 2020. Due to record low allocations, Russian pensions now own just \$6 bn of equities, substantially lower than foreign funds at \$32 bn. However, on our forecasted asset growth and likely increases in equity allocations, Russian pension funds may reach \$40-60 bn, overtaking foreign investment in the next few years.

Exhibit 4: Russian pension funds hold record low amount of equities, yet in the next 5 years domestic investors could overtake foreigners Foreign and Russian fund holdings in equities



Source: CBR, EPFR, Goldman Sachs Global Investment Research.

# Exhibit 5: Even at a nearly 20% 2015-20 CAGR, the pension market would remain underpenetrated relative to developed markets Pension system assets to GDP across countries



Source: OECD, Goldman Sachs Global Investment Research.

# Asset mix will likely shift towards equities

Russian private pension funds currently allocate over 80% of their assets to bank deposits and fixed-income instruments. We see three reasons why equity allocations in Russian pension funds will increase: growth in size, changes in regulation and lower inflation.

# 1) Increase in scale to increase complexity

We find that pension funds tend to change their asset allocations as they get scale, becoming more sophisticated and increasing allocations to equities, derivatives and private equity (see Exhibits 6 and 7). Thus current allocations of c.80% are fairly typical for a nascent pension system: for example, in South Africa fixed income and bank deposit allocation was as high as 65%-70% in the late 1980s, but now constitutes less than 40% of the portfolio. We expect to see a similar trend in Russia – as pension fund assets grow in the next 5 years, asset class diversification is likely.

Exhibit 6: Complexity of investments grows with size...



Source: Goldman Sachs Global Investment Research.

### Exhibit 7: ...which is supported by empirical data

Pension fund total AuM vs. investments in other plain vanilla products by country



For Poland we used AuM and equity allocations pre-2013 reform, after which AuM of funds halved and equity allocations increased to over 80% of the portfolio

Source: OECD, Goldman Sachs Global Investment Research.

Goldman Sachs Global Investment Research

### **Exhibit 8: We believe Russian pension allocations will change over time** Russian private pension funds' portfolio structure\*

100% 4% 4% 5% 7% 7% 12% 13% 6% 10% 6% 90% 12% 12% 7% 11% 80% 70% 60% 50% 90% 86% 87% 83% 81% 81% 40% 30% 20% 10% 0% 2008 2009 2010 2011 2012 2013 2014 Russian private pension funds portfolio structure\* Cash & Fixed income Equities Other assets

### \*based on the data on NPFs managing savings

Source: CBR.

# Exhibit 9: South Africa is a good example: c.20% of funds were allocated to equities in the 1980s which almost tripled by 2014 South African pension fund portfolio structure\*



\*1980 & 1985 data based on the data for private funds only

Source: FASB.

# 2) Change in regulation to allow higher risk

In 2015-16, the CBR is expected to introduce a number of measures aimed at increasing the risk appetite and investment horizon of pension funds. In particular, funds will be required to be profitable every five years (previously every year), and their remuneration will be changed from a success fee to a combination of management and success fees. In addition, the CBR continues to reduce the maximum limit on investing in banks' bonds and deposits: It is currently 60%, but is expected to fall to 40% from 2016.

**Exhibit 10: Decrease in the level of repo rates...** CBR key rate (1w repo) dynamics



Source: CBR, Goldman Sachs Global Investment Research.

Exhibit 11: ...and regulatory changes are additional supportive factors for the growth of equity holdings

Change in regulation for non-state pension funds (NPFs)



Source: CBR, Goldman Sachs Global Investment Research.

# 3) Decline in interest rates

Bank deposits and fixed income are particularly attractive to pension funds when inflation is high and GDP growth is low, like in 2014-15. This, however, is expected to change: our economists forecast the Central Bank's key 1-week repo rate to decline to 7% in 2016 (from 11.0% now), and GDP growth in 2016-17 to return to +1.4%/2.6% compared with -2.7% this year, making equities a more attractive investment.

# Pension funds can change Russian equity and debt markets

We believe the influx of money from pension funds can profoundly change Russian capital markets. In equities, we believe volatility can decrease, dividend discipline can improve, and valuations rise. In fixed income, in our view, the trend will be toward lower real rates and higher demand for long-term, secure, inflation-linked instruments.

# Equities: Lower volatility, better dividends, higher valuations

Pension funds tend to become long-term holders of stocks, thus stabilizing equity markets and reducing volatility. They are also key participants in deal flows, accumulating substantial stakes in companies at IPO. Poland is a good example where pension funds' average holding period is twice as high as for any other investors. Further reduced volatility in both Poland and South Africa (see Exhibits 12-13) is positively correlated with valuations. The same reduction should contribute positively to Russian P/E multiples, which are now the lowest in global emerging markets.

**Exhibit 12: Long-term domestic holders will likely reduce market volatility...** Pension funds' ownership of free-float vs. volatility of local markets – volatility measured using 5-year average standard deviation of returns







Source: World Federation of Exchanges, MOEX, WSE, JSE, Haver analytics, FASB, CBR, PFR.

Source: Bloomberg.

We also believe pension funds will tend to pursue higher dividends and may accumulate substantial minority stakes of companies to have influence on dividend discipline. Indeed, dividend yields in Poland and South Africa, where pension funds play an important role, are higher than in Russia.

# Exhibit 14: In Poland growth in pension fund AuM was one of the drivers behind IPO activity

Private pension fund equity holdings vs. IPOs



### Exhibit 15: Pension funds usually push for higher dividends Dividend yield of markets



Source: Bloomberg.

Finally, we believe a large and active domestic pool of capital will move deal activity onshore and ultimately reduce residual premiums seen by London-listed depository receipts of some Russian stocks. We believe Moscow Exchange is particularly well positioned to benefit from this trend, while the local shares of Magnit could see solid performance if their discount to the depository receipts contracts.

Source: Haver analytics, WSE, Bloomberg.

### **Exhibit 16: Valuations of Russian stocks could improve**... P/E of MSCI indices by countries



**Exhibit 17: ...and GDR premiums vs. local shares could shrink** Discount of local stocks to GDRs



Source: Bloomberg.

Source: Bloomberg.

## Exhibit 18: MOEX, Magnit and Alrosa could be key beneficiaries of pension system development

Name	Rating	Upside to 12m price target	Market cap, US\$ bn	6m ADV US\$ mn	Key stock themes
MOEX	Buy	43%	2	8	Infrastructure & dividends - MOEX is the main Russian trading venue, and should benefit from any increase of equity and fixed income market activity - We expect MOEX to keep increasing its dividend payout and believe development of the pension system supports the dividend side of the story
Magnit (local shares)	Buy	33%	16	22	<b>Discount of local shares vs. GDRs</b> - Better market valuations and lower volatility should drive local market trading activity, which would narrow the discount of local shares to GDRs - In addition it could create incentive for index providers to include local shares into indices
Alrosa	Buy	72%	7	9	<b>Dividends</b> - We currently expect Alrosa to distribute 50% of its net income to shareholders. However, as a company with strong FCF generation it could increase dividend payout if shareholder attention to dividends becomes higher

Source: FactSet, Goldman Sachs Global Investment Research.

# **Exhibit 19: Russian names with MICEX listing should benefit from local markets' development as well** List of the Russian names that are covered by GS and have Russian listing

Company	Sector	Market cap, US\$ mn
Gazprom	Energy	43 355
Rosneft	Energy	33 924
Lukoil	Energy	25 779
Novatek	Energy	24 403
Norilsk Nickel	Metals and Mining	22 903
Sberbank	Financial Services	21 639
Magnit	Retail	21 336
Surgutneftegaz	Energy	20 342
JSC VTB Bank	Financial Services	11 972
Gazprom Neft	Energy	9 672
Tatneft	Energy	9 083
Uralkali	Metals and Mining	8 573
Severstal	Metals and Mining	8 365
MegaFon	Telecoms	7 312
Novolipetsk Steel	Metals and Mining	6 982
Alrosa	Metals and Mining	6 649
Mobile Telesystems	Telecoms	6 444
United Co. Rusal	Metals and Mining	6 270
Bashneft	Energy	4 239
Yandex NV	Media	3 406
Magnitogorsk Steel	Metals and Mining	3 204
Sistema JSFC	Telecoms	3 045
Rostelecom	Telecoms	2 758
RusHydro	Utilities	2 708
E.ON Russia	Utilities	2 368
Moscow Exchange	Financial Services	2 192
Qiwi	Financial Services	1 236
LSR Group	Construction	860
TMK	Metals and Mining	782
Globaltrans	Transportation	612
Aeroflot	Transportation	564
Dixy Group	Retail	531
M-video	Retail	474
Total		329 383

Source: FactSet, Goldman Sachs Global Investment Research.

## Fixed income: Lower rates, demand for new products

Despite the reallocation into equities that we expect, pension funds will likely remain large holders of fixed-income instruments. In Exhibits 20-21, we show that the current holdings of debt securities by pension funds at \$40 bn are already equal to half of the entire banking systems holdings of debt securities, and we believe that pension funds can catch-up by 2020. This demand, in our view, may contribute to declining real interest rates in the country, as they remain way above EM median.

Exhibit 20: Pension funds will likely provide new inflow into debt markets, compared with all Russian banking system... Holding of Russian debt - banks vs. pension funds\*



Debt securities holdings, USD bn

Assuming by 2020 funds will keep c.40% of the portfolio in debt securities

Source: CBR, Goldman Sachs Global Investment Research.

Source: Bloomberg, Goldman Sachs Global Investment Research.





We also believe pension funds will generate demand for long-term, inflation-linked instruments. Not surprisingly they have been among the key buyers for inaugural CPI-linked bonds from the Ministry of Finance and are active buyers of infrastructure bonds.





Source: Goldman Sachs Global Investment Research.

# **MOEX (Buy): Main beneficiary of capital market development**

Being the main Russian listing and trading market, we believe that Moscow Exchange (MOEX.MM, Buy, 12-month price target Rub102.0) is best positioned to benefit from the development of local capital markets. MOEX has a diversified business portfolio with a high degree of vertical integration and dominant market positions in almost every segment, thus higher volumes would have a very positive effect on its earnings. Additionally, we believe higher shareholder attention to cash distribution should improve valuations of dividend paying stocks: we expect MOEX to increase its dividend payout ratio from 55% in 2014 to 70% by 2017. On our estimates MOEX trades at 8.8x/7.6x 2016/17 P/E, a 46%/50% discount vs. the global exchanges median.

**MOEX should capture most upside from local market development** due to its leading positions in almost every part of capital markets (see Exhibit 23). Over the last few years MOEX has invested heavily in infrastructure development (e.g. transition to T+2, partnership with Euroclear/Clearstream), and sizably increased its capital base, thus standing ready if volumes increase.

In an environment of higher shareholder attention to cash distributions, dividend names will likely be valued more. We expect that during the presentation of the new dividend policy in September MOEX will announce a gradual increase of its payout (we expect 70% payout by 2017 from 55% in 2014). We don't see many obstacles to this as: (1) MOEX already completed its largest investments and operates a modern infrastructure, and (2) National Clearing Centre, MOEX's clearing house, is adequately capitalized and can sustain capital organically. MOEX has a 2016E dividend yield of 7%, highest among global exchange peers (Exhibit 24). We value MOEX using a three-stage dividend discount model.

## Exhibit 23: MOEX has dominant market positions

Market shares of Moscow Exchange in the major business segments



**Exhibit 24: Moscow Exchange offers a best-in-class dividend yield** 2016E dividend yield of the global exchanges



Source: Russian exchanges, Goldman Sachs Global Investment Research.

Source: Bloomberg, FactSet, Goldman Sachs Global Investment Research.

# Magnit (Buy): Changes in Russian capital markets to support strong fundamental story

We view Magnit as one of the strongest investment stories in the Russian consumer space due to its best-in-class execution, attractive growth profile (supported by a strong balance sheet) and CF generation (translating into solid cash returns). We also view the company as one of the key beneficiaries of convenience and trading down trends highlighted in our recent consumer report (*Russian consumer close-up*, July 6, 2015). We believe Magnit local shares offer more attractive exposure to the above themes due to their 25.5% discount to GDRs, which we view as unjustified. We expect this discount to narrow supported by improving activity in Russian equity markets post pension fund reform.

Magnit – Structural leader in Russian consumer space. We expect the company to remain one of the fastest growing food retailers in our coverage (next 5-year RUB CAGR of 24%) due to its best-in-class execution coupled with a strong balance sheet. Further its focus on improving efficiency and CF generation supports our expectations of solid cash returns (CROCI to improve to 21.5% from 18.5% in 2015-19E) and increasing dividends (we forecast the payout ratio to crease to 60% in 2019 from 40% in 2015). We value both Magnit shares using an EV/GCI/CROCI methodology applying 12.5x target multiple to 2016 estimates.

**Magnit is one of the key beneficiaries from convenience and trading down trends** which we highlighted in our recent report. Over 75% of Magnit's revenues come from the convenience format oriented towards a low income population where proximity to customers and attractive prices are the key competitive advantages. The company is the market leader in this format in Russia (soft discounters/convenience stores) with over 40% market share.

We expect the discount of local shares to GDRs to narrow; prefer locals to GDRs. We believe the current discount of Magnit's local shares to GDRs (25.5% - one of the largest among Russian large caps) is not justified given exposure to the same high quality investment story and similar liquidity profiles as GDRs. In our view expected pension funds reform may accelerate contraction of the discount. We thus believe Magnit local shares offer more attractive exposure to stock-specific fundamental story as well as key trends in Russian consumer and structural changes in the Russian equity market.

Exhibit 25: Magnit remains the only large cap with such a high discount of locals to GDRs, which we view as unjustified YTD median discount of local shares to GDRs/ADRs, %



Source: Datastream.

Exhibit 26: MGNT remains one of the most attractive retailers both in Russian and CEEMEA space due to its solid growth/return profile 2015-17 CAGR of sales (US\$ terms) vs. CROCI (%) for CEEMEA retailers



Source: Goldman Sachs Global Investment Research

# Alrosa (Buy): Dividends/deleveraging to come as solid FCF generation sustained

We view Alrosa (ALRS.MM, Buy, 12-month price target RUB109.0) as offering the best exposure in our coverage to the diamond market, where we see attractive long-term fundamentals. In addition, we believe Alrosa could be of special interest to pension funds, because of its high FCF yield and low leverage, implying substantial upside to dividend payout.

**Our bullish view on Alrosa** is driven by our expectations that it will continue to outperform vs. benchmarks and deliver sustainable industry-leading returns (2015-18E average CROCI of 30% vs. mining peer average of 10%) on the back of its high profitability based on stringent cost control, volume growth and FX tailwinds (average 2015-18E EBITDA margins of 54% vs. mining peers average of 32%). We note that our view on Alrosa is predicated by our long-term positive outlook on the diamond market and its strong positions driven by world-class mineral reserves base, and solid sales structure franchise.

We expect Alrosa to increase its dividend payout ratio to 50% in 2016 from the minimum rate of 35%. This forecast is underpinned by our expectations of strong cash flow in the coming years (2015-18E FCF yield of 24%) and low leverage (net debt to average 2015-17 EBITDA is 0.5x). Given robust fundamentals and potential for increase in dividend yields, we believe Alrosa is one of the best ways to invest in the rise of pension funds theme. We value Alrosa using target EV/EBITDA multiple applied to 2016E estimates.

Exhibit 27: We expect dividends and debt reduction to be the key uses of cash



Exhibit 28: Strong FCF generation should allow the company to pay higher dividend vield



Source: Company data, Goldman Sachs Global Investment Research.

Source: Company data, Goldman Sachs Global Investment Research.

# Key risks

### We see three important risks to our thesis:

- 1. The government's commitment to reform is key for Russian pension funds to continue receiving pensioners' contributions. In 2015 the Pension Fund of Russia is projected by the government to run a deficit of c.Rub623 bn which will be covered by state subsidies, and therefore we expect a debate within the government on whether this gap has to be covered via budget revenues, or through a nationalization of pension contributions. In essence, the government needs to find revenues today to allow for creation of a saving pool for tomorrow.
- 2. The government or Central Bank may impose restrictions on the investment strategies of pension funds, including directed purchases of certain instruments which is not an uncommon practice for a long time South Africa has "prescribed assets", mandating how pension money has to be invested.
- 3. Most pension funds are under the umbrella of big financial groups (Exhibit 29), creating risks of related-party transactions that CBR has to closely monitor. Also, corruption within any of the funds could discredit the whole concept of private pension funds, and thus effective supervision will continue to be extremely important.

Key risks to our view and price targets:

**MOEX**: Risks to our view are lower-than-expected client balances, weaker volumes, lower-than-expected dividend payout ratio and higher cost inflation.

**ALRS**: Risks to our view are lower-than-expected diamond prices, FX volatility, cost inflation, growth execution slippages, and regulatory/fiscal risks.

**MGNT**: Risks related to the macro and consumer situation in Russia, competition, regulation (changes to the current Retail Law), management execution on cost optimization and capital investments.

# **Appendix 1: Market structure**

Exhibit 29: Concentration of pension fund market has increased substantially since 2008; top 10 groups now control over 80% of assets

Key non-state pension funds (NPFs) in the pension market, 2015, MS - Market share of total assets

#	Group name	NPFs of the group	AUM, USD bn	MS, %
1	Alor	NPF Promagrofond, Nasledie, KIT-finans, Gazfond, Gazfond Pension Savings	10.6	25%
2	Otkritie	NPF Lukoil Garant, NPF of electroenergy	5.5	13%
3	<b>Russian Railways</b>	NPF Blagosostoyanie	4.1	10%
4	Sberbank	NPF Sberbank	3.8	9%
5	01	NPF Buduschee, Stalfond, Telekom- soyuz	3.6	9%
6	Bin	NPF Evropeiskiy, Regionfond, NPF Raiffeisen, Doverie, Obrazovanie i nauka	2.2	5%
7	Rosgosstrakh	NPF RGS	1.7	4%
8	VTB	NPF VTB	1.4	3%
9	Transneft	NPF Transneft	1.0	2%
10	Renova	NPF Bolshoi, Atomgarant, Vladimir	0.8	2%
Tot	al top 10 NPF grou	34.6	83%	

Source: CBR, NPFs data, RusRating, Goldman Sachs Global Investment Research.

# **Appendix 2: Russian pension system structure and key developments**

Exhibit 30: Design of the Russian pension system



Source: PFR, Goldman Sachs Global Investment Research.

## Exhibit 31: Key developments in Russian pension system



Source: PFR, Goldman Sachs Global Investment Research.

# **Appendix 3: Regulatory constraints on NPF investments**

Exhibit 32: Equities and corporate bonds can account for 65%/80% of NPF's portfolio. Going forward CBR could limit amount of funds invested in banks' deposits and fixed income instruments

# Regulatory limits on non-state pension funds investments

Government securities	100%
Municipal securities of the subjects of the Russian Federation	40%
Municipal bonds	40%
Corporate bonds	80%
Banking groups' bonds & deposits (max combined)*	60%
Equities	65%
Shares in the unit trusts	20%
Mortgage backed securities	40%
Max share of funds in credit organization and affiliated entities	
(including deposits and securities)	25%
*could be changed to 40%	

Source: CBR, Goldman Sachs Global Investment Research.

# Appendix 4: Design of the Polish and SA pension systems

Exhibit 33: Pension system of Poland resembles Russia's, having a big pay-as-you-go (PAYG) element and a mandatory funded part. The South African pension system is very different, with no obligatory employer contributions and well-developed voluntary part

		Mandatory	Voluntary pensions		
		Pillar I	Pillar II	Pillar III	
	Contribution:	16.72% of gross payroll	2.8% of gross payroll: employee has a choice of transferring all contributions to Pillar I or Pillar II	Basic contribution of 7% of the gross payroll, additional contributions should not exceed 4.5x of average Polish wage	
oland	Pay-as-you-go or funded?	PAYG	Funded	Funded	
Pola	Type of contribution:	Notional defined contribution on a virtual account	Defined contribution (=real money) on mandatory individual accounts	Defined contribution (=real money)	
	Managed by:	State - Social Insurance Institution (ZUS)	Private institutions - Open Pension Funds (OFEs), which are governed by Pension Societies (PTEs)	Private institutions	
ca	Contribution:	Means-tested social security old-age grant (Rn1,260 per month)		Occupational pensions (average contribution of c.15% of earnings)	
Afri	Pay-as-you-go or funded?			Funded	
South	Type of contribution:	Financed from general government revenues		Defined contribution (=real money) on mandatory individual accounts	
	Managed by:	State		Private institutions - variety of pension schemes	

Source: OECD, Goldman Sachs Global Investment Research.

# **Disclosure Appendix**

# **Reg AC**

We, Dmitry Trembovolsky, Anton Farlenkov, Igor Gerasimov and Daniil Fedorov, hereby certify that all of the views expressed in this report accurately reflect our personal views about the subject company or companies and its or their securities. We also certify that no part of our compensation was, is or will be, directly or indirectly, related to the specific recommendations or views expressed in this report.

Unless otherwise stated, the individuals listed on the cover page of this report are analysts in Goldman Sachs' Global Investment Research division.

## **Investment Profile**

The Goldman Sachs Investment Profile provides investment context for a security by comparing key attributes of that security to its peer group and market. The four key attributes depicted are: growth, returns, multiple and volatility. Growth, returns and multiple are indexed based on composites of several methodologies to determine the stocks percentile ranking within the region's coverage universe.

The precise calculation of each metric may vary depending on the fiscal year, industry and region but the standard approach is as follows:

Growth is a composite of next year's estimate over current year's estimate, e.g. EPS, EBITDA, Revenue. **Return** is a year one prospective aggregate of various return on capital measures, e.g. CROCI, ROACE, and ROE. **Multiple** is a composite of one-year forward valuation ratios, e.g. P/E, dividend yield, EV/FCF, EV/EBITDA, EV/DACF, Price/Book. **Volatility** is measured as trailing twelve-month volatility adjusted for dividends.

## Quantum

Quantum is Goldman Sachs' proprietary database providing access to detailed financial statement histories, forecasts and ratios. It can be used for in-depth analysis of a single company, or to make comparisons between companies in different sectors and markets.

# **GS SUSTAIN**

GS SUSTAIN is a global investment strategy aimed at long-term, long-only performance with a low turnover of ideas. The GS SUSTAIN focus list includes leaders our analysis shows to be well positioned to deliver long term outperformance through sustained competitive advantage and superior returns on capital relative to their global industry peers. Leaders are identified based on quantifiable analysis of three aspects of corporate performance: cash return on cash invested, industry positioning and management quality (the effectiveness of companies' management of the environmental, social and governance issues facing their industry).

## **Disclosures**

## Coverage group(s) of stocks by primary analyst(s)

Dmitry Trembovolsky: EMEA New Markets-Financials. Anton Farlenkov: EMEA New Markets-Turkey Non Financials, EMEA-Small & Mid Cap. Yulia Chekunaeva: EMEA Mining, EMEA Mining - Precious, EMEA Steel. Yulia Gerasimova: EMEA-Small & Mid Cap.

EMEA Mining: Alrosa, Israel Chemicals, Israel Chemicals, Jastrzebska Spolka Weglowa SA, KAZ Minerals PIc, KGHM Polska Miedz SA, Norilsk Nickel, United Co. Rusal, Uralkali, Uralkali.

EMEA Mining - Precious: Acacia Mining Plc, Anglo American Platinum, AngloGold Ashanti, Dominion Diamond Corp., Fresnillo Plc, Gem Diamonds, Gold Fields, Harmony Gold, Hochschild Mining Plc, Impala Platinum Holdings, Koza Gold, Lonmin, Lonmin, Petra Diamonds, Platinum Group Metals Ltd., Polymetal International Plc, Polyus Gold International, Randgold Resources, Sibanye Gold.

EMEA New Markets-Financials: Abu Dhabi Commercial Bank, African Bank Investments, Akbank, Al-Rajhi Bank, Alinma Bank, Arab National Bank, Banque Saudi Fransi, Barclays Africa Group, Burgan Bank, Capitec Bank Holdings, Commercial Bank of Qatar, Commercial Inter'l. Bank (Egypt), Doha Bank, Dubai Financial Market, Dubai Islamic Bank, EFG Hermes, Emirates NBD, First Gulf Bank, Firstrand Ltd., Investec Plc, JSC VTB Bank, Kipco, Kuwait Finance House, Moscow Exchange, National Bank of Abu Dhabi, National Bank of Kuwait, National Commercial Bank, Nedbank Group, Qatar Islamic Bank, Qatar National Bank, Qiwi, Riyad Bank, Samba Financial Group, Saudi British Bank, Sberbank, Standard Bank Group, TCS, Turkiye Garanti Bankasi, Turkiye Halk Bankasi AS, Turkiye Isbankasi, Turkiye Vakiflar Bankasi, Union National Bank, Yapi Kredi.

EMEA New Markets-Turkey Non Financials: Akcansa, Akfen Holding, Anadolu Cam Sanayii, Anadolu Efes, Arcelik, Aygaz, Brisa, Celebi Hava Servisi, Cimsa, Coca Cola Icecek, Dogan Holding, Dogus Otomotiv, Emlak Konut, Ford Otosan, Haci Omer Sabanci Holding, Koc Holding, Migros Ticaret, Sise Cam, Soda Sanayii, TAV, Teknosa, Tofas, Trakya Cam Sanayii, Turk Traktor, Ulker Biskuvi.

EMEA Steel: Erdemir, Evraz Plc, Magnitogorsk Steel, Novolipetsk Steel, Severstal, TMK.

EMEA-Small & Mid Cap: Aeroflot, BIM Birlesik Magazalar AS, Dixy Group, DP World, Enka Insaat ve Sanayi AS, Etalon Group, Eurocash SA Group, Gedeon Richter, Global Ports Investments, Globaltrans, Hikma Pharmaceuticals Plc, Lenta, Life Healthcare Group, LPP S.A., LSR Group, M-video, Magnit, Magnit, MD Medical Group Investments Plc, Mediclinic International Ltd., Myronivsky Hliboproduct SA, Netcare Ltd., O'KEY Group, Pegasus Hava Tasimaciligi, PKP Cargo SA, Tekfen Holding, Turkish Airlines, X5 Retail Group.

## **Company-specific regulatory disclosures**

The following disclosures relate to relationships between The Goldman Sachs Group, Inc. (with its affiliates, "Goldman Sachs") and companies covered by the Global Investment Research Division of Goldman Sachs and referred to in this research.

Goldman Sachs has received compensation for investment banking services in the past 12 months: Alrosa (Rubl65.00) and Moscow Exchange (Rubl74.31)

Goldman Sachs expects to receive or intends to seek compensation for investment banking services in the next 3 months: Alrosa (Rubl65.00), Magnit (Rubl12,275.00) and Moscow Exchange (Rubl74.31)

Goldman Sachs has received compensation for non-investment banking services during the past 12 months: Moscow Exchange (RubI74.31)

Goldman Sachs had an investment banking services client relationship during the past 12 months with: Alrosa (Rubl65.00) and Moscow Exchange (Rubl74.31)

Goldman Sachs had a non-investment banking securities-related services client relationship during the past 12 months with: Moscow Exchange (Rubl74.31)

Goldman Sachs had a non-securities services client relationship during the past 12 months with: Alrosa (Rubl65.00), Magnit (Rubl12,275.00) and Moscow Exchange (Rubl74.31)

### Distribution of ratings/investment banking relationships

Goldman Sachs Investment Research global coverage universe

	Rating Distribution			Investment Banking Relationships		
	Buy	Hold	Sell	Buy	Hold	Sell
Global	32%	53%	15%	46%	38%	33%

As of July 1, 2015, Goldman Sachs Global Investment Research had investment ratings on 3,248 equity securities. Goldman Sachs assigns stocks as Buys and Sells on various regional Investment Lists; stocks not so assigned are deemed Neutral. Such assignments equate to Buy, Hold and Sell for the purposes of the above disclosure required by NASD/NYSE rules. See 'Ratings, Coverage groups and views and related definitions' below.

## Price target and rating history chart(s)





## **Regulatory disclosures**

### **Disclosures required by United States laws and regulations**

See company-specific regulatory disclosures above for any of the following disclosures required as to companies referred to in this report: manager or co-manager in a pending transaction; 1% or other ownership; compensation for certain services; types of client relationships; managed/co-managed public offerings in prior periods; directorships; for equity securities, market making and/or specialist role. Goldman Sachs usually makes a market in fixed income securities of issuers discussed in this report and usually deals as a principal in these securities.

The following are additional required disclosures: **Ownership and material conflicts of interest:** Goldman Sachs policy prohibits its analysts, professionals reporting to analysts and members of their households from owning securities of any company in the analyst's area of coverage. **Analyst compensation**: Analysts are paid in part based on the profitability of Goldman Sachs, which includes investment banking revenues. **Analyst as officer or director**: Goldman Sachs policy prohibits its analysts, persons reporting to analysts or members of their households from serving as an officer, director, advisory board member or employee of any company in the analyst's area of coverage. **Non-U.S. Analysts**: Non-U.S. analysts may not be associated persons of Goldman, Sachs & Co. and therefore may not be subject to NASD Rule 2711/NYSE Rules 472 restrictions on communications with subject company, public appearances and trading securities held by the analysts.

Distribution of ratings: See the distribution of ratings disclosure above. Price chart: See the price chart, with changes of ratings and price targets in prior periods, above, or, if electronic format or if with respect to multiple companies which are the subject of this report, on the Goldman Sachs website at http://www.gs.com/research/hedge.html.

### Additional disclosures required under the laws and regulations of jurisdictions other than the United States

The following disclosures are those required by the jurisdiction indicated, except to the extent already made above pursuant to United States laws and regulations. **Australia**: Goldman Sachs Australia Pty Ltd and its affiliates are not authorised deposit-taking institutions (as that term is defined in the Banking Act 1959 (Cth)) in Australia and do not provide banking services, nor carry on a banking business, in Australia. This research, and any access to it, is intended only for "wholesale clients" within the meaning of the Australian Corporations Act, unless otherwise agreed by Goldman Sachs. In producing research reports, members of the Global Investment Research Division of Goldman Sachs Australia may attend site visits and other meetings hosted by the issuers the subject of its research reports. In some instances the costs of such site visits or meetings may be met in part or in whole by the issuers concerned if Goldman Sachs Australia considers it is appropriate and reasonable in the specific circumstances relating to the site visit or meeting. Brazil: Disclosure information in relation to CVM Instruction 483 is available at http://www.gs.com/worldwide/brazil/area/gir/index.html. Where applicable, the Brazil-registered analyst primarily responsible for the content of this research report, as defined in Article 16 of CVM Instruction 483, is the first author named at the beginning of this report, unless indicated otherwise at the end of the text. Canada: Goldman Sachs Canada Inc. is an affiliate of The Goldman Sachs Group Inc. and therefore is included in the company specific disclosures relating to Goldman Sachs (as defined above). Goldman Sachs Canada Inc. has approved of, and agreed to take responsibility for, this research report in Canada if and to the extent that Goldman Sachs Canada Inc. disseminates this research report to its clients. Hong Kong: Further information on the securities of covered companies referred to in this research may be obtained on request from Goldman Sachs (Asia) L.L.C. India: Further information on the subject company or companies referred to in this research may be obtained from Goldman Sachs (India) Securities Private Limited, Goldman Sachs may beneficially own 1% or more of the securities (as such term is defined in clause 2 (h) the Indian Securities Contracts (Regulation) Act, 1956) of the subject company or companies referred to in this research report. Japan: See below. Korea: Further information on the subject company or companies referred to in this research may be obtained from Goldman Sachs (Asia) L.L.C., Seoul Branch. New Zealand: Goldman Sachs New Zealand Limited and its affiliates are neither "registered banks" nor "deposit takers" (as defined in the Reserve Bank of New Zealand Act 1989) in New Zealand. This research, and any access to it, is intended for "wholesale clients" (as defined in the Financial Advisers Act 2008) unless otherwise agreed by Goldman Sachs. Russia: Research reports distributed in the Russian Federation are not advertising as defined in the Russian legislation, but are information and analysis not having product promotion as their main purpose and do not provide appraisal within the meaning of the Russian legislation on appraisal activity. Singapore: Further information on the covered companies referred to in this research may be obtained from Goldman Sachs (Singapore) Pte. (Company Number: 198602165W). Taiwan: This material is for reference only and must not be reprinted without permission. Investors should carefully consider their own investment risk. Investment results are the responsibility of the individual investor. United Kingdom: Persons who would be categorized as retail clients in the United Kingdom, as such term is defined in the rules of the Financial Conduct Authority, should read this research in conjunction with prior Goldman Sachs research on the covered companies referred to herein and should refer to the risk warnings that have been sent to them by Goldman Sachs International. A copy of these risks warnings, and a glossary of certain financial terms used in this report, are available from Goldman Sachs International on request.

**European Union:** Disclosure information in relation to Article 4 (1) (d) and Article 6 (2) of the European Commission Directive 2003/126/EC is available at http://www.gs.com/disclosures/europeanpolicy.html which states the European Policy for Managing Conflicts of Interest in Connection with Investment Research.

Japan: Goldman Sachs Japan Co., Ltd. is a Financial Instrument Dealer registered with the Kanto Financial Bureau under registration number Kinsho 69, and a member of Japan Securities Dealers Association, Financial Futures Association of Japan and Type II Financial Instruments Firms Association. Sales and purchase of equities are subject to commission pre-determined with clients plus consumption tax. See company-specific disclosures as to any applicable disclosures required by Japanese stock exchanges, the Japanese Securities Dealers Association or the Japanese Securities Finance Company.

### Ratings, coverage groups and views and related definitions

**Buy (B), Neutral (N), Sell (S)** -Analysts recommend stocks as Buys or Sells for inclusion on various regional Investment Lists. Being assigned a Buy or Sell on an Investment List is determined by a stock's return potential relative to its coverage group as described below. Any stock not assigned as a Buy or a Sell on an Investment List is deemed Neutral. Each regional Investment Review Committee manages various regional Investment Lists to a global guideline of 25%-35% of stocks as Buy and 10%-15% of stocks as Sell; however, the distribution of Buys and Sells in any particular coverage group may vary as determined by the regional Investment Review Committee. Regional Conviction Buy and Sell lists represent investment recommendations focused on either the size of the potential return or the likelihood of the realization of the return.

**Return potential** represents the price differential between the current share price and the price target expected during the time horizon associated with the price target. Price targets are required for all covered stocks. The return potential, price target and associated time horizon are stated in each report adding or reiterating an Investment List membership.

**Coverage groups and views:** A list of all stocks in each coverage group is available by primary analyst, stock and coverage group at http://www.gs.com/research/hedge.html. The analyst assigns one of the following coverage views which represents the analyst's investment outlook on the coverage group relative to the group's historical fundamentals and/or valuation. **Attractive (A)**. The investment outlook over the following 12 months is favorable relative to the coverage group's historical fundamentals and/or valuation. **Neutral (N)**. The investment outlook over the following 12 months is neutral relative to the coverage group's historical fundamentals and/or valuation. **Cautious (C)**. The investment outlook over the following 12 months is unfavorable relative to the coverage group's historical fundamentals and/or valuation.

Not Rated (NR). The investment rating and target price have been removed pursuant to Goldman Sachs policy when Goldman Sachs is acting in an advisory capacity in a merger or strategic transaction involving this company and in certain other circumstances. Rating Suspended (RS). Goldman Sachs Research has suspended the investment rating and price target for this stock, because there is not a sufficient fundamental basis for determining, or there are legal, regulatory or policy constraints around publishing, an investment rating or target. The previous investment rating and price target, if any, are no longer in effect for this stock and should not be relied upon. Coverage Suspended (CS). Goldman Sachs has suspended coverage of this company. Not Covered (NC). Goldman Sachs does not cover this company. Not Available or Not Applicable (NA). The information is not available for display or is not applicable. Not Meaningful (NM). The information is not meaningful and is therefore excluded.

## **Global product; distributing entities**

The Global Investment Research Division of Goldman Sachs produces and distributes research products for clients of Goldman Sachs on a global basis. Analysts based in Goldman Sachs offices around the world produce equity research on industries and companies, and research on macroeconomics, currencies, commodities and portfolio strategy. This research is disseminated in Australia by Goldman Sachs Australia Pty Ltd (ABN 21 006 797 897); in Brazil by Goldman Sachs do Brasil Corretora de Títulos e Valores Mobiliários S.A.; in Canada by either Goldman Sachs Canada Inc. or Goldman, Sachs & Co.; in Hong Kong by Goldman Sachs (Asia) L.L.C.; in India by Goldman Sachs (India) Securities Private Ltd.; in Japan by Goldman Sachs Japan Co., Ltd.; in the Republic of Korea by Goldman Sachs (Asia) L.L.C., Seoul Branch; in New Zealand by Goldman Sachs New Zealand Limited; in Russia by OOO Goldman Sachs; in Singapore by Goldman Sachs (Singapore) Pte. (Company Number: 198602165W); and in the United States of America by Goldman, Sachs & Co. Goldman Sachs International has approved this research in connection with its distribution in the United Kingdom and European Union.

**European Union:** Goldman Sachs International authorised by the Prudential Regulation Authority and regulated by the Financial Conduct Authority and the Prudential Regulation Authority, has approved this research in connection with its distribution in the European Union and United Kingdom; Goldman Sachs AG and Goldman Sachs International Zweigniederlassung Frankfurt, regulated by the Bundesanstalt für Finanzdienstleistungsaufsicht, may also distribute research in Germany.

### **General disclosures**

This research is for our clients only. Other than disclosures relating to Goldman Sachs, this research is based on current public information that we consider reliable, but we do not represent it is accurate or complete, and it should not be relied on as such. We seek to update our research as appropriate, but various regulations may prevent us from doing so. Other than certain industry reports published on a periodic basis, the large majority of reports are published at irregular intervals as appropriate in the analyst's judgment.

Goldman Sachs conducts a global full-service, integrated investment banking, investment management, and brokerage business. We have investment banking and other business relationships with a substantial percentage of the companies covered by our Global Investment Research Division. Goldman, Sachs & Co., the United States broker dealer, is a member of SIPC (http://www.sipc.org).

Our salespeople, traders, and other professionals may provide oral or written market commentary or trading strategies to our clients and principal trading desks that reflect opinions that are contrary to the opinions expressed in this research. Our asset management area, principal trading desks and investing businesses may make investment decisions that are inconsistent with the recommendations or views expressed in this research.

The analysts named in this report may have from time to time discussed with our clients, including Goldman Sachs salespersons and traders, or may discuss in this report, trading strategies that reference catalysts or events that may have a near-term impact on the market price of the equity securities discussed in this report, which impact may be directionally counter to the analyst's published price target expectations for such stocks. Any such trading strategies are distinct from and do not affect the analyst's fundamental equity rating for such stocks, which rating reflects a stock's return potential relative to its coverage group as described herein.

We and our affiliates, officers, directors, and employees, excluding equity and credit analysts, will from time to time have long or short positions in, act as principal in, and buy or sell, the securities or derivatives, if any, referred to in this research.

The views attributed to third party presenters at Goldman Sachs arranged conferences, including individuals from other parts of Goldman Sachs, do not necessarily reflect those of Global Investment Research and are not an official view of Goldman Sachs.

Any third party referenced herein, including any salespeople, traders and other professionals or members of their household, may have positions in the products mentioned that are inconsistent with the views expressed by analysts named in this report.

This research is not an offer to sell or the solicitation of an offer to buy any security in any jurisdiction where such an offer or solicitation would be illegal. It does not constitute a personal recommendation or take into account the particular investment objectives, financial situations, or needs of individual clients. Clients should consider whether any advice or recommendation in this research is suitable for their particular circumstances and, if appropriate, seek professional advice, including tax advice. The price and value of investments referred to in this research and the income from them may fluctuate. Past performance is not a guide to future performance, future returns are not guaranteed, and a loss of original capital may occur. Fluctuations in exchange rates could have adverse effects on the value or price of, or income derived from, certain investments.

Certain transactions, including those involving futures, options, and other derivatives, give rise to substantial risk and are not suitable for all investors. Investors should review current options disclosure documents which are available from Goldman Sachs sales representatives or at http://www.theocc.com/about/publications/character-risks.jsp. Transaction costs may be significant in option strategies calling for multiple purchase and sales of options such as spreads. Supporting documentation will be supplied upon request.

All research reports are disseminated and available to all clients simultaneously through electronic publication to our internal client websites. Not all research content is redistributed to our clients or available to third-party aggregators, nor is Goldman Sachs responsible for the redistribution of our research by third party aggregators. For research, models or other data available on a particular security, please contact your sales representative or go to http://360.gs.com.

Disclosure information is also available at http://www.gs.com/research/hedge.html or from Research Compliance, 200 West Street, New York, NY 10282.

#### © 2015 Goldman Sachs.

No part of this material may be (i) copied, photocopied or duplicated in any form by any means or (ii) redistributed without the prior written consent of The Goldman Sachs Group, Inc.